DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 317 501 SP 032 042

TITLE	Attracting, Retaining and Rewarding Teachers. What Research Says about Series Number 6.
INSTITUTION	National Education Association, Washington, D.C. Research Div.
PUB DATE	Sep 86
NOTE	21p.
PUB TYPE	Information Analyses (070)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Elementary Secondary Education; *Job Satisfaction; *Labor Turnover; Research Utilization; *Teacher Characteristics; *Teacher Recruitment; *Teaching (Occupation)

ABSTRACT

This report on attracting and retaining teachers presents highlights of two major categories of research studies on the topic. The first are the findings of Schlechy, Vance, and Weaver on the characteristics of the teacher workforce. The research findings are abstracted and policy recommendations are included. The second group is comprised of studies that broaden the scope of and give insight into these problems from the teachers' perspective inside the work place. Included in this group are abstracts of research studies by Chapman and Hutcheson; Weaver; McLaughlin; Milbrey Wallin, et al; Dworkin; Croft, Litt and Turk; Stratford and Bird; Maddux, et al; Louis Harris & Associates, Inc.; and Georgia Professional Standards. (JD)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED317501

National Education Association

RESEARCH

•What Research Says About:

ATTRACTING, RETAINING AND REWARDING TEACHERS

Number 6

SP 032 044

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

L. Kiel

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy

Professional and Organizational Development/Research Division

Foreword

Three years of reforms stressing the quality of education are behind us. Not surprisingly, problems of attracting, retaining and rewarding teachers are still receiving the lion's share of attention from state policymakers, task forces, and commissions that support the importance of education. Now the scope of these problems and the issues embedded within them are taking on broader dimensions. Potential points of intervention as currently envisioned range all the way from the creation of a national standards board for the teaching profession to greater teacher participation in decision-making at the local district and building level.

There is no way to accurately predict what reformers will do next, but several things are clear. There is consensus that teacher salaries must continue to be improved as a major aspect of problem solution. In addition, actions directed toward improving resources and conditions in the workplace that impact teachers' motivation and abilities to carry out their work must also become an integral part of reform proposals.

This report provides data and information to assist the Association and affiliates in their efforts to be certain that future proposals for reform go beyond the teacher and his or her characteristics. There is also a need to reform the school as a workplace—its resources, structure and dynamics that impact the lives of everyone involved in the teaching-learning process. The intrinsic qualities of the school workplace are as important in attracting, retaining, and rewarding teachers as compensation. To attend to one without considering the other is to miss critical aspects of what it will take to achieve fundamental reforms that produce quality education.

September 1986

ATTRACTING, RETAINING AND REWARDING TEACHERS
Number 6

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
THE CONTEXT	5
CHARACTERISTICS OF THE TEACHER WORKFORCE	6
TEACHER JOB DISSATISFACTION AND TURNOVER	10
SUMMARY	19
REFERENCES	20

Leaders, staff and members of the Association and its affiliates can anticipate a second wave of educational reforms. Agendas from the Education Commission of the States, the National Council of State Legislators, the National Governors Association and the Southern Region Education Board signal that these political power networks are mutually supporting a common intent and theme. They will pursue a variety of efforts to change the standards, organization and structure of education at all levels with particular emphasis on administration, management and teaching.

Certainly, it is too soon to predict the exact form that future proposals for change at the state level might take. However, certain general characteristics of the political reformers and the reform movement are clear and need to be understood by advocates for those whose lives in the workplace will be directly impacted by the reforms that will be forthcoming.

- In contrast to past reform movements, and contrary to outmoded beliefs based on that past, today's reform movement is not just one more flash in the pan. Reformers are using tools of the information age—power networking, strategic planning, surveys, findings from educational research and consultation with technical experts to shape the issues, content and action strategies incorporated in reform proposals.
- Concerns about the economy and technology, and fondness for private sector philosophies of management are both implicit and explicit as the major touchstones used by policymakers for developing visions and scenarios of the future. They define the purposes, priorities, and plans for changing education and the teaching profession in keeping with those touchstones.
- Three years of experience, combined with successful efforts by educators and their advocates, have influenced political leaders to acknowledge the importance of incorporating research on the characteristics and conditions of effective schools and organizations as considerations for future reform proposals.
- Differences in political philosophies and values are both implicit and explicit in the various ways in which individual political leaders use the research to define the problems of education, select and publicize the issues, and choose action strategies to solve the problems as each perceives them.
- Problems of attracting, retaining and rewarding teachers remain high on the list of unresolved areas of concern to policymakers, the public, and the teaching profession. Reform proposals will continue to address issues related to these problems.

All of these characteristics make it critical for the Association and its affiliates to remain informed on the research that is shaping the thinking, direction, and actions of political leaders who are powering the educational reform movement. This report is intended to assist in that regard by highlighting two major categories of studies.

First are the highly publicized and influential findings of Schlechty, Vance, and Weaver on characteristics of the teacher workforce. Policymakers used this research selectively to justify their interpretations of issues and prescriptions alleged to address the problems that schools face in drawing, holding, and appropriately rewarding quality teachers. Because the results of this research are still front and center in the minds of policymakers, it is abstracted from its original form. Second are less publicized studies that broaden the scope and insights into these problems from a different perspective—a view from the teachers' perspective inside the workplace. This second group of findings is sometimes overlooked by policymakers intent on holding teachers accountable for the quality of education without examining the conditions that act as barriers to teachers in carrying out their roles more effectively.

Taken together, the highlights contained in this report can be used to a) increase understanding of what influences the thinking of many reformers and b) provide additional information for broadening the perspective of reformers who fail to adequately consider how proposed reforms will impact conditions in the workplace that militate against the schools abilities to attract, retain, and reward teachers.

CHARACTERISTICS OF THE TEACHER WORKFORCE

Research related to the characteristics of those who enter, those who remain, and those that leave education has been quoted across the nation. The following investigations highlight the findings that are often quoted by opinionmakers. Because the work of Schlechty and Vance was instrumental in galvanizing the attention of the public and policymakers, their policy recommendations are also included. It is interesting to note how reformers have framed key issues in ways that often remove them from the context in which these researchers originally introduced them. Notice too that the researchers' recommendations are rarely if ever quoted. In short, these findings have influenced opinions and opinionmakers in ways that teacher advocates must understand if improved alternatives are to be recommended.

Schlechty, Phillip C. and Victor S. Vance, "Recruitment, Selection and Retention: The Shape of the Teaching Force." Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Education, February 1982. [ED 221541]

In this study, the authors examined eight groups of beginning teachers with common demographic characteristics in North Carolina from 1973 to 1980 to determine the characteristics of those who enter, those who remain, and those who leave education over time. The National Teacher's Examination Weighted Common Examinations score was used as a measure for academic ability to establish 10 rankings within each group. The data revealed the following conclusions:

- It seems reasonable to project from the data that approximately half of the North Carolina teachers who entered teaching in 1980 will no longer be teaching in 1990.
- There is a strong negative correlation between measured academic ability and retention in teaching. Those entering teaching with the highest academic ability are the most likely to leave education early and in the largest numbers, regardless of race, sex or entering year.
- The decline of opportunities in education is of less significance than the expansion of employment opportunities in other segments of the economy.
- As things now stand, the characteristics of the talent pool that will be available to teaching is largely controlled by institutions and agencies that have only a passing interest in the education of teachers . . . or those that have a vested interest in maintaining the status quo.
- Given the reality or perception of an inadequate supply of competently trained teachers, the public schools have been encouraged to develop reward systems aimed more at recruiting new members than at maintaining or motivating persons once they had been successfully recruited.
- The orgnizational structure of schools provides few meaningful ways of promotion and advancement (for teachers), and what few ways there are require one to renounce teaching and become an administrator or quasi-administrator.
- In the quest for credentialling and the production of teachers with degrees, while at the same time producing increasing quantities of teachers, there was a tendency to relegate teacher education to the newest institutions of higher education or those institutions of higher education without a clear reputation for quality.
- The process to determine who will be teachers is self-selective, and those who are most likely to select themselves as teachers are drawn from the least academically able college populations. However, this study found that 28 percent of those persons employed to teach were above the median for all college graduates on the Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT).
- There is an intellectual crisis in schools, and it will get worse unless fundamental reform occurs in the organization of schools and in the structure of the teaching occupation.

The authors made the following *policy recommendations* that seem most critical in restructuring the

occupation, in teacher training, and the organization of schools:

- Those who would improve the quality of the teaching corps by concentrating only on standards for certification are taking a truncated view of the problem... Policies aimed at keeping out less able teachers do not assure that more able teachers will enter education. Neither do such policies assure that more able teachers will stay in teaching once they have entered.
- To look inside education for solutions to problems of teacher quality is not adequate... If policymakers wish to improve the quality of teachers, they must attend to the quality of life that teaching provides new entrants.
- The quality of teachers who serve in our schools is at least as much a function of the quality of life teaching affords as it is a function of admission standards and scores on tests.
- Any effort to reform teacher education—unless it is coupled with systematic efforts to reform the structure of teaching and the work lives of teachers—will have little chance of success. If teacher education becomes more rigorous and demanding, it seems likely that many of the most academically able teachers who now enter teaching will choose not to do so. This is simply because, without some effort and commitment, they can get more of what society has to offer from other occupations.
- Responsibility for the professional training of teachers should be divorced from institutions of higher education and teacher education should once again be placed where it in fact occurs ... in the public schools.
- If we are to improve the ability of schools to recruit and retain the services of the most able, and if we are to create organizations that get extraordinary performances out of ordinary people, which schools must do if democracy and excellence are to be compatible, it is essential that public school administrators be made aware of the best thinking regarding the management of personnel. It is also essential that school administrators be recruited and selected from among those who have the most demonstrated competence in personnel management.

Vance, Victor S. and Phillip C. Schlechty, "The Structure of the Teaching Occupation and the Characteristics of Teachers: A Sociological Interpretation." Chapel Hill, North Carolina: University of North Carolina, 1982.

The authors conducted a second study to discover whether their findings in the previous study, that was limited to North Carolina teachers, could be generalized to other teachers in other situations. This National Longitudinal Study (NLS) of 1972 high school seniors sought to describe some characteristics of recent high school graduates who went on to college, graduated, and entered teaching. The variables studied were: locus of control; self-concept; community, family, and work values; and academic ability. The purpose of the study was to test in a preliminary way the line of reasoning that whatever peculiar patterns are reflected in the initial entrants into the occupation, these patterns would be amplified as the entering cohort matured; that those who enter teaching as a group might be more academically able than those who stay; and that persons from rural areas would be more likely to stay in teaching. The authors concluded that:

- The characteristics of the teaching corps are determined by social forces beyond the control of teacher education institutions. For example:
  - Teachers are disproportionately drawn from among those college graduates who were born in small towns and rural communities.
  - Education disproportionately attracts persons from the lower ranges of academic ability and socio-economic status (SES) and these persons also seem more likely to stay in the occupation.

— Recruits to education are generally less academically able than nonrecruits, but those who are recruited to education are more academically able than those who are committed to staying in teaching.

— Persons from low and medium SES backgrounds are over-represented among the recruits, but low and medium SES persons are even more over-represented among those who choose to stay in teaching.

— Persons who consider it very important to be able to find steady work are somewhat over-represented in the recruits to education; they are even more over-represented in the committed teachers.

- If teacher education and teaching were to deny access to college students who scored in the lowest 20 percent of all college graduates on the Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT), the effect would be to deny an accessible academic major or occupation opportunities to between 10 and 15 percent of all persons who now graduate from college. This denial would have more of an impact on females and blacks than it would on males.
- If schools of education and public school employers insisted that to be a teacher one must score above an SAT-verbal score of 496 (the mean of nonrecruits), nearly 70 percent of those in the sample of this study who indicated they were committed to teaching at age 30 would be denied access to the teaching occupation.
- The failure of teaching to continually enhance and enrich opportunities within the occupation has caused the occupation to fall further and further behind.
- Blacks disproportionately anticipate leaving teaching, whereas in the previous study blacks disproportionately stayed in teaching. Also, academically able blacks are not any more likely to go into teaching than academically able whites.
- Between teacher education and the entry into the occupation of teaching, nearly 15 percent of the college educated work force is distributed to occupations and social roles other than education.
- Those who are retained in teaching tend to be drawn from among those with more limited career options available to them.
- Teaching will become the exclusive domain of academically inferior white females if minimum competency tests are mandated that will exclude the lower fifth, and if students from the upper half of college graduates continue to leave teaching in increasingly large numbers.
- Given the truncated view of legislators, solutions to the problem of recruiting and selecting high quality teachers are not likely to be found if one concentrates attention only on institutions of higher education or on upgrading certification requirements.
- If policymakers wish to exclude the bottom quarter or the bottom half of college graduates from the talent pool (teaching positions today account for approximately 10 percent of all college graduates), they must pay the price for attracting the top half. That price is substantially higher than most legislators seem to be willing to acknowledge.

Nelson, F. Howard, "New Perspectives on the Teacher Quality Debate: Empirical Evidence from National Longitudinal Survey." ***Journal of Educational Research*** **(78), January/February, 1985, pp. 133-140.**

This study purports to improve on the data obtained from the comprehensive National Longitudinal Study (NLS) conducted by Vance and Schlechty in 1982. (See study cited above.) By utilizing eight measures of aptitude and applying sample weight to the NLS data to correct for potential sample and nonresponse bias, this study yielded more favorable comparisons of teachers to other college graduates and to college-bound high school seniors than found in previous studies.

Using the NLS data, the Vance and Schlechty study (1982) showed that teachers scoring in the top ten percent according to the Scholastic Aptitude Test-Verbal (SAT-V) or Scholastic Aptitude Test-Mathematics (SAT-M) left the profession most rapidly during 1976-1979. The most able indicated the greatest intention to leave the profession. The ability/defection relationship, however, is unclear for the remaining 90 percent of teachers. The results of this study indicated that most of the disproportionate defection of the most able appears to be among the nonpublic school teachers and not among the public school teachers. The most significant findings of this study are as follows:

- Teachers employed in nonpublic schools have higher verbal test scores; however, these schools retain fewer high-scoring teachers than the public schools.
- While less than 3.5 percent of college graduates majoring in education come from the bottom quarter of their high school class, they are just as likely to find jobs as teachers and to get paid as much as other teachers.
- Less than 25 percent (22.5) of those who become teachers indicated the field of education as a prospective major as high school seniors.

Nelson concludes from this study, that prospective education majors among the college-bound represent only a small portion of the pool of talent from which the teaching profession draws membership. Also, the problem of retaining talented teachers may be greatest in the nonpublic school sector, and the inability of public schools to retain the best teachers may be overstated when contrasted with nonpublic schools.

Teachers suffer job dissatisfaction or leave teaching for reasons that go beyond major unhappiness with low salaries. Factors that contribute to low teacher morale, feelings of inadequacy, low self-esteem and the like focus on conditions in the workplace. It becomes evident that restructuring the workplace to support effective teaching is essential to attracting, retaining and rewarding teachers.

Chapman, David W. and Sigrid M. Hutcheson, "Attrition from Teaching Careers: A Discriminant Analysis." *American Educational Research Journal* (19), No. 1, Spring 1982, pp. 93-105.

These researchers examined the career pattern of 690 alumni from three public universities in Indiana who indicated that their first employment after receiving their degree was elementary or high school teaching. They investigated differences in skills and abilities and criteria used to judge differences in success between individuals who started as teachers and subsequently changed careers (NONTEACH), and those who started in and remained in teaching (TEACH). The study was conducted as as secondary analysis of data originally collected in Project CHOICE in 1979-80. Project CHOICE surveyed graduates of all programs in these universities who had graduated during selected years from 1967 to 1978.

Data from the discriminant analyses support the following findings:

- Those who left education entirely went into a wide range of other occupations.
- The great majority of individuals who left teaching did not consider their educational experiences well utilized in their new employment.
- One-third of those who are currently teaching reported their educational experiences are not well utilized.
- Across both elementary and high school levels, people remaining in teaching were characterized as having greater organizational skills (organizing time, developing new approaches, planning and organizing activities).
- Those leaving teaching were characterized as having greater analytic skills (analyzing and evaluating, interpreting numerical data).
- Elementary teachers changing careers rated themselves higher on their ability to persuade others to accept their ideas, whereas, high school teachers do not rate their skill at persuading others to accept their ideas to be any lower than those who left teaching.
- At the high school level, NONTEACH respondents were more positive about their ability to cooperate with a work team. These respondents appear to have gone into careers which often involve collaboration and team work.
- Sex, race, current age, or the institution a person attended were not significantly related to teacher attrition.
- Elementary teachers who left teaching assigned greater importance to factors such as salary increases, job responsibility/autonomy, the opportunity to learn new things, and the chance to contribute to important decisions. Those who remained in teaching valued recognition by supervisors and administrators.
- High school teachers remaining in teaching were characterized as regarding approval from family and/or close friends and recognition by supervisors/administrators as more important in judging career success. Those who left teaching were characterized as assigning more importance to job responsibility/autonomy and to salary increases.
- Criteria for success widely valued in other fields, such as salary and job autonomy, appear to have greatest relevance for teachers who leave teaching.

Weaver, W. Timothy, "Solving the Problem of Teacher Quality, Part I." *Phi Delta Kappan*, October 1984, pp. 108-115.

The author presents research findings dating back to 1928 which suggests an ebb and flow in the level of talent attracted to teaching. Since 1970, however, data indicate a decline in the level of academic ability among both men and women who have been attracted to teaching.

Weaver also reviews historical data with respect to the changing labor market to show that talent flows toward opportunity. Given that salary is the single most important factor in attracting talent to any field, the price will be high to attract the best talent into teaching. He states that "if the public schools are to compete for the most talented individuals produced by U.S. colleges and universities, the schools must expect to pay the highest wages that such talent can command." He further states that "individuals who are attracted to a career that ranks in the bottom third, in terms of economic rewards, turn out to be individuals who are themselves in the bottom third, in terms of scholastic ability. Changes in certification requirements will not affect this situation." As we look for a solution to the problem of attracting more qualified teachers from the talent pool, Weaver suggests that a more permanent solution lies in a redefinition of the mission of schools and departments of education.

McLaughlin, Milbrey Wallin, et al., "Why Teachers Won't Teach." *Phi Delta Kappan*, February 1986 pp. 420-426.

This article is based upon the findings of an ongoing study of the sources of teacher effectiveness and satisfaction currently being conducted by four researchers at the Stanford University School of Education. Members of the research team held hour-long interviews with 85 elementary and secondary teachers representing five school districts in the San Francisco Bay Area. The teachers in the sample had differing levels of teaching experience in schools located in both high and low-income areas.

The authors cited excerpts from teacher interviews conducted in the study that depict the conditions of work which undermine teachers feelings of competence, efficacy, and self-worth. Examples of school conditions that prevented teachers from obtaining the rewards (promoting student' growth and development) that initially attracted them to teaching included isolation, lack of instructional materials, lack of recognition, and orders by fiat. The process of teaching which was described as frustrating, unrewarding, and intolerably difficult, fosters a sense of personal failure within even the most dedicated teachers. Because of this inability to fulfill their initial aspirations, many of these competent and talented teachers either leave the profession (won't teach) or remain in teaching with a sense of dull cynicism or futility. The authors state that "this research on teachers supports the major finding of other studies of service-oriented professions: inadequate opportunities for psychological or personal success inevitably weaken commitment to and acceptance of the organization."

The major premise of the findings of this study is that teachers who can't teach and eventually won't teach are the victims of an educational system that is structured to guarantee the failure of teachers. The authors portend that the problem of attracting and retaining competent and committed public school teachers will be exacerbated without organizational responses that structure the workplace of teaching for success.

Dworkin, Anthony Gary, "The Changing Demography of Public School Teachers: Some Implications for Faculty Turnover in Urban Areas." *Sociology of Education* (53) April 1980, pp. 65-73.

This study represents part of a larger research project mandated by the school board of one of the nation's largest urban school districts in a Southwestern metropolis. Data were based on a sample of 3,549 public school teachers. The purpose of the investigation was to explore differences in the occupational origins of age cohorts of three racial groups of

urban public school teachers. It examined the variation of race and occupational origin as factors affecting attitudes toward continuing a teacher career. It also incorporated an additional variable which compared the actual assignment of a teacher to a school of a given racial composition against that teacher's expressed preference for placement or nonplacement in such a school. Thus, it was possible to examine these factors as influences on decisions to quit teaching and subsequently to link faculty desegregation guidelines to the problem of teacher turnover. Some of the significant findings were as follows:

- Younger black and white teachers significantly more often come from higher level professional and white collar families than do their oldest cohorts, while younger Mexican-American teachers more often come from lower blue collar and farm backgrounds than their older counterparts.
- In general, teachers who plan to quit are white, under the age of 36, come from higher level occupational origins, and are assigned to schools with student racial distributions they define as undesirable.
- There is a slightly higher incidence of teachers from blue collar origins in the 36 to 45 year-old age cohort than in any other white cohort.
- Nearly 40 percent of the youngest black teachers have occupational origins in the higher status occupational categories, while less than 20 percent of their older counterparts come from these categories.
- The younger Chicano cohorts are concentrated in blue collar families of origin, while the older teachers are concentrated in white collar families of origin.
- New teachers of the middle class origins, regardless of their race, are significantly more likely to quit teaching if they perceive their assignments undesirable than are individuals from working class backgrounds.

Federal mandates for faculty desegregation that consider only the teacher's race and ignore occupational origins, force school districts to replace teachers who resign from urban districts with individuals who are equally likely to quit teaching.

Croft, John C., et al., "Some Relationships between Administrators' Opinions and Teachers' Quitting Behavior in an Urban Public School System." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association in Montreal, Canada, April 11-15, 1983. [ED 231 020]

As part of a larger research project conducted in one of the nation's largest public school districts of a Southwestern metropolis, this study examined the impact of administrators' opinions on teacher quitting behavior. The questionnaire was used to test 12 hypotheses. Twelve demographic and organizational variables were drawn from seven categories to analyze data and develop models. The categories were:

1. *Actor traits*: a teacher's personal characteristics
2. *Building characteristics*: aspects of the work setting
3. *Investments/options*: commitment factors such as years on the job and translatability of skills to other employment
4. *Satisfaction/solidarity*: commitment factors such as the intrinsic meaningfulness of a job and a sense of collegiality with coworkers
5. *Administrative style conflict*: teachers' perception involving faculty evaluation, academic support, and school-community relations
6. *Teacher role alienation*: a sense of powerlessness or isolation
7. *Teacher role exit*: quitting

Based upon a sample of 3,389 or 48.4 percent returns out of 7,000 mailed questionnaires, the following findings were reported:

- There was minuscule support for the view that principals' attitudes are the most decisive factor in teacher quitting behavior.
- Actual quitting behavior (except for natural causes) was infrequent, and where it occurred it was more strongly associated with investments/ options among teachers.
- Most teachers stay and are alienated more by factors other than perceived discrepancies in administrative style.
- Teachers with more years invested in teaching and those with specialized training quit less than those without such investments.
- Teachers with economic options such as alternative sources of income (income independence) are more likely to quit.
- Alienated teachers were more likely to quit than those not alienated.
- In general, older teachers and minority teachers quit less often than younger teachers.
- Of teachers who did quit, ethnic minorities and women quit more often than men.
- Among building characteristics only grade level was often associated with quitting behavior.

Georgia Professional Standards Commission, Atlanta, "Teacher Satisfaction in Georgia and the Nation: Status and Trends. Teacher Burnout: Causes and Possible Cures," 1980. [ED 194 515]

Research findings have frequently attributed teacher turnover at both the state and national levels to the high incidence of teacher stress or "burnout." This report, therefore, addressed the nature and source of teacher burnout, its effects on the educational systems, and the possibilities for change.

During the 1978-79 school year, officials in the Savannah-Chatham County (Georgia) school system, designed a questionnaire to elicit faculty attitudes toward their jobs and the school system from a random sample of its teachers. The results of this survey revealed a number of recognized causes of teacher burnout as sources of their dissatisfaction, i.e., inadequate administrative support; lack of intrinsic rewards; increase in disciplinary problems; isolation, inadequate information about the reasons behind important decisions and policies affecting their work; an unreasonable amount of clerical work; inadequate salaries to maintain standards of living and inadequate professional training.

This report discussed the above reasons for teacher dissatisfaction in the context of additional findings as documented by an extensive bibliography of 74 references. Included in the discussion were the consequences of teacher burnout and a wide range of options for minimizing or eliminating its existence. The Commission recommended cooperative efforts involving teachers, administrators, school systems, teacher preparation institutions, and the public to help alleviate the high incidence of teacher stress or burnout.

Litt, Mark D. and Dennis C. Turk, "Sources of Stress and Dissatisfaction in Experienced High School Teachers." *Journals of Educational Research* (78), January/February, 1985, pp. 178-185.

This study provides a multidimensional construct of teacher stress encompassing job satisfaction, negative well-being, absenteeism, and intention to leave teaching. The independent variables were perceived role, school climate, coping resources, and specific work problems. The purpose of the study was to identify those features of teachers' work environment with the best predictive value for this multidimensional concept of stress.

The sample was comprised of 360 Connecticut public high school teachers with from 5 to 15 years of experience. A total of 291 or 81 percent responded. Highlights of the results of the survey were as follows:

- The three worst problems chosen by teachers as sources of distress were inadequate salary, low

status of the teaching profession, and too much paperwork.

- Pupil misbehavior, or discipline problems were not viewed as a major contributor to dissatisfaction or distress.
- Role conflict and relationship with supervisors were significantly associated with job stress.
- The role teachers perceived for themselves and the school climate, particularly the relationship with administrators, may be extremely important in predicting job stress.
- Intention to leave teaching was significantly associated with job satisfaction.
- The most important reasons cited for thinking about leaving teaching were:
  - Salary (76 percent)
  - Poor opportunities for advancement (45 percent)
  - Too much work to do or too little time to accomplish it (35 percent)
- Teachers' coping resources were unrelated to job satisfaction or physical stress but related to intention to leave teaching.
- Those teachers who had higher amounts of job dissatisfaction and greater feelings of negative well-being also reported a greater number of absences.

Douglas, Stratford and Ronald E. Bird, "Personal Labor Supply: An Estimation of a Probabilistic Teacher Labor Supply Function." Research Triangle Park, North Carolina: Southeastern Regional Council for Educational Improvement, 1985. [ED 261 464]

This experimental theoretical study provides a probabilistic teacher labor supply model. It used qualitative research findings and econometric methods to estimate the supply of teachers under various conditions, especially different salaries and supervision received. It predicts both the size and character of teacher supply responsiveness. "A probabilistic model of an individual's decision whether or not to teach has the potential of providing a richer, fuller understanding of the teacher supply process."

The study attempted to use econometric techniques to discover which aspects of the teaching career are valuable to individuals and how such valuation varies from individual to individual. The conceptual model builds its predictions on the basis of observing which individuals are in fact teachers and relates their career choice to their personal attributes (such as race, sex, age, and marketability in the labor market) and to some attributes of the school system (such as pay, bureaucracy, and student characteristics) they serve.

The basic data set used in the study was the *1983 Current Population Survey* (CPS) of the U.S. Census Bureau, and data from the *Digest of Education Statistics, 1983-84* of the National Center for Education Statistics. Observations of Southeast region residents (Alabama, Arkansas, Florida, Georgia, Kentucky, Louisiana, Mississippi, North Carolina, South Carolina, Tennessee, Virginia, and West Virginia) were extracted and compiled to form the regional data set used in the analysis. This sample was composed of all college graduates in the CPS for the 12 southeastern states. Current results of this study indicated the following findings:

- An individual's personal characteristics are stronger determinants of the desire to teach than are the available measured characteristics of the school systems that might hire him/her.
- For teachers whose spouses have a very high income, teaching becomes less attractive.
- People who are teachers would be able to command higher salaries in other occupations. This may indicate that teaching offers greater intrinsic rewards than many other professions.
- Nonwhite college graduates are more likely to teach than are whites.
- Teachers are more likely to have graduate degrees (Masters or higher) than college educated workers as a whole.

- Urban college graduates, with their more varied opportunities, are less likely to find teaching an attractive career.
- The average salary offered teachers is the most important *measurable* policy determinant of predisposition to teaching among the variables included in this study.
- The more bureaucracy teachers must deal with, the less attractive teaching is for potential candidates.
- Perhaps more emphasis should be placed on evaluating the effectiveness of principals rather than teachers; by weeding out the principals who alienate responsible, capable teachers, it might be possible to retain higher quality teachers.
- Raising teacher pay and increasing the professional autonomy of teachers will tend to selectively enrich the teacher labor pool of white, male, urban, primary earners or persons who have at least one of these characteristics.
- Higher wages and less control will tend to be most effective in attracting and retaining younger teachers.
- An across-the-board increase in teacher pay would be an effective policy in addressing the problem of teacher attrition due to the following events: (a) having a child, (b) moving from a rural to metropolitan area, and (c) a large (50 percent) increase in the spouse's income.
- If market conditions (expected supply of teachers minus demand) are not altered, shortages of teachers will emerge over time as attrition removes present teachers.

It is the belief of the authors that models such as this one should provide policymakers from the local to the national level with a tool to estimate both the size and the composition of the potential teacher supply in response to changes in conditions under which teachers work.

Maddux, Cleborne D., et al., "A Survey of Texas Public School Teachers," 1980 [ED 212 559], and Henderson, David L., et. al. "Moonlighting, Salary, Morale, and the Approaching Teacher Shortage: A Follow-up Study," October 1982 [ED 223 594]

The genesis of the orginial study was the belief of the authors that there appeared to be a trend of deteriorating morale among public school teachers enrolling in graduate level courses at the Sam Houston University. Increasing numbers of these practicing teachers reported that they were experiencing financial difficulties and were being forced to "moonlight" in order to meet their monthly living expenses. On the basis of data obtained from Allan C. Ornstein's recent national study showing that teachers' purchasing power had decreased a total of 17 percent between 1969 and 1980, the authors submitted a survey proposal to the Texas State Teacher's Association (TSTA) to determine how widespread these problems were among teachers in Texas. (NOTE: Basic data for Ornstein's study were obtained from *Estimates of School Statistics, 1970-71* and *1979-80*, and *Prices, Budgets, Salaries, and Income, 1979*, Washington, D.C.: National Education Association.) The initial survey was conducted in May 1980. Questionnaires were mailed to 424 randomly selected TSTA members with a final return of 291 or 70 percent responses. The findings of this analysis revealed that:

- Twenty-two percent of the teachers were moonlighters, mostly holding menial, low-paying extra jobs.
- Sixty-four percent of the moonlighters indicated that they thought their extra job interferred with their teaching effectiveness.
- Seventy-five percent of the moonlighters indicated that they would quit moonlighting if their salaries were increased sufficiently. (The average moonlighter supplemented his/her salary by $2,799.)
- More than one in every three (38.4 percent) teachers indicated that they were seriously consid-

ering leaving teaching as a profession, with 46 percent indicating low pay as the reason.

- Nearly half of the male teachers (48.3 percent) and 33.5 percent of female teachers indicated that they were seriously considering leaving the profession.
- Other reasons for discontent cited were problems with the administration, excessive paper work, lack of input into school policy decisions, and problems concerning students such as discipline and lack of motivation.
- Seventy-one percent indicated that they have working spouses.
- Approximately 40 percent of the teachers were the major breadwinner in their families.
- Only 38.8 percent contributed less than half of the family income.
- Most of the respondents (40.5 percent) taught in urban districts; 32.6 percent in suburban, and 26.8 percent in rural districts.

Following the national and international media response to the above findings, the authors approached TSTA again relative to a follow-up study. TSTA agreed to the idea of repeating the study every two years in order to help identify the trends. Therefore, a second questionnaire was mailed to 491 randomly selected TSTA members in May 1982, resulting in a return rate of 65 percent (319) for analysis.

In the interim, teachers in Texas received an increase in salary from 1980 to 1982 in excess of the average increase in the past. However, according to the "intermediate standard budget" figure set yearly by the U.S. Department of Labor as the amount of income required for a family of four to live in the middle class, nothing was gained in terms of real purchasing power. The significant findings in the 1982 study were as follows:

- More than one in every three teachers (37.3 percent) were seriously considering giving up teaching as a profession, with 50 percent indicating low pay as the reason.
- Approximately 43 percent of the male teachers and 36 percent of the female teachers were considering leaving teaching.
- The 119 teachers who indicated that they were seriously considering leaving the teaching profession listed 140 reasons in the following categories: 50 percent were financial; 24 percent related to working conditions such as stress, burnout, paperwork, hassles with administrators, and class size; 13 percent related to students concerning discipline, attitudes and apathy; 6 percent were thinking of retiring; 4 percent were thinking of jobs in business and industry and 3 percent miscellaneous.
- Twenty-nine percent of the teachers indicated that they were moonlighting. (The average moonlighter supplemented his/her salary by $3,189.)
- Fifty-nine percent of the moonlighters were the major breadwinners in their households.
- More than 54 percent of the moonlighters indicated that they were seriously considering giving up teaching.
- Almost 69 percent of the moonlighting teachers responded that their teaching was adversely affected by the second job.
- Seventy-five percent of the moonlighters indicated that they would quit moonlighting if their salaries were increased sufficiently.
- Over 42 percent of the moonlighting teachers were male.

Louis Harris & Associates, Inc., "The Metropolitan Life Survey of Former Teachers in America," April-June, 1985.

This nationwide study of teacher attrition is a companion study to the Metropolitan Life Survey of

the American Teacher 1985 that was commissioned by the Metropolitan Life Insurance Company. The data for this survey were obtained from telephone interviews of a national sample of 500 former teachers who left public schools within the last five years to work in some other occupation, and 1,846 currently teachers in grades K–12. Former teachers were located through a random sample of current teacher and principal referrals of former teachers known to them. A copy of the complete study is available to the public. Highlights of the findings of this study were as follows:

- Thirty-five percent of former teachers now earn a median income increase of $4,000 (more than $30,000 per year) or about 19 percent greater than income from teaching.
- Fifty-seven percent felt great stress several days a week or more as a teacher. In their nonteaching job, only 22 percent experience this degree of stress.
- Ninety-six percent are satisfied with their new career change.
- Forty-seven percent of former teachers experienced some satisfaction during their teaching career.
- Fifty-eight percent miss teaching; 83 percent are unlikely to return to the classroom, and 17 percent are likely to return in the next five years if conditions improve.
- Sixty percent cited poor salaries as the chief reason for leaving teaching.
- Thirty-six percent listed such poor working conditions as too much paperwork, too many nonteaching duties, and lack of input about their jobs as reasons for leaving the profession of teaching.
- Two-thirds of former teachers (64 percent) reported that their professional prestige was worse than they had expected it would be before they began to teach.
- Nearly twice as many current teachers (37 percent) aspire to enter professional specialties as the proportion of former teachers (20 percent) who have moved into these jobs.
- A majority believe that salary, professional prestige, control over one's work, equipment one needs for work, and intellectual challenge are all better in their new occupations than in teaching.
- Similar proportions of former and current teachers reported having a master's degree (54 percent v. 53 percent), having been asked to supervise other teachers (51 percent v. 47 percent), and having received an award for their teaching (39 percent v. 37 percent).
- Forty-six percent of former teachers had less than 10 years experience, compared to 22 percent of current teachers.
- Twenty-eight percent of current teachers held a second job during the past 12 months. About twice this proportion of former teachers (54 percent) worked a second job during their last year as a teacher.
- A majority of former teachers (53 percent) reported that they were dissatisfied with teaching.
- Two-thirds of the former teachers are men and seven in ten former teachers taught in secondary schools.
- Eighty percent of both current and former teachers supported the following changes that would help teachers to be treated like professionals, paid more like professionals, and given working conditions and materials to allow them to perform as professionals: (a) providing a decent salary, (b) providing more respect for teachers in today's society, (c) teaching students who are more strongly motivated to learn, and (d) providing increased financial support for the school system.

- Majorities of current and former teachers agreed on the following steps which would "help a lot" to attract and produce good teachers in the future: (a) providing compensation to teachers comparable to other professionals requiring similar training, (b) reducing time spent on nonteaching duties, (c) paying compensation partly according to qualifications, (d) providing advanced study sabbaticals, (e) upgrading accreditation standards for teacher training programs, (f) upgrading admission standards for education majors, and (g) requiring a supervised internship before certification.

SUMMARY

This report has attempted to show that educational research should lead the way in outlining needed reforms in the restructuring of public schools. School improvement programs should be implemented on the basis of research findings. These insights from research that identify the sources and effects of teacher dissatisfaction, particularly in the workplace, cannot continually be ignored in the formulation of education reform policies and mandates. It is, incumbent upon political leaders and school administrators to heed the findings of educational researchers and take a broader and more realistic view of the problems related to attracting, retaining and rewarding competent teachers in our public schools. If not, this educational reform movement is likely to have the same lasting effects as those of past decades. Policymakers can and should take a holistic view of bringing about fundamental changes in the organization of schools.

Chapman, David W., and Hutcheson, Sigrid M., "Attrition from Teaching Careers: A Discriminant Analysis." *American Educational Research Journal* 19: 93-105; Spring 1986.

Croft, John C. et al., "Some Relationship between Administrators' Opinions and Teachers Quitting Behavior in an Urban Public School System." (ED 231 020) Montreal, Canada: Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, April 11-15, 1983.

Douglas, Stratford, and Bird, Ronald E., "Personal Labor Supply: An Estimation of a Probilistic Teacher Labor Supply Function." (ED 261 464) Research Triangle Park, North Carolina: Southeastern Regional Council for Educational Improvement, 1985.

Dworkin, Anthony Gary, "The Changing Demography of Public School Teachers: Some Implications for Faculty Turnover in Urban Areas." *Sociology of Education* 53: 65-73; April, 1980.

Georgia Professional Standards Commission, (ED 194 515) Atlanta, GA: "Teacher Satisfaction in Georgia and the Nation: Status and Trends, Teacher Burnout: Causes and Possible Cures." 1980.

Henderson, David L. et al., "Moonlighting, Salary, Morale, and the Approaching Teacher Shortage: A Follow-up Study." (ED 223 594) Texas State Teachers Association, October 1982.

Litt, Mark D., and Turk, Dennis C., "Sources of Stress and Dissatisfaction in Experienced High School Teachers." *Journey of Educational Research* 78: 178-185; January/February, 1985.

Louis Harris & Associates, Inc., New York, NY: "The Metropolitan Life Survey of the American Teacher, 1985: Strengthening the Profession, Survey No. 854002." April-June, 1985.

Maddux, Cleborne D., et al., *A Survey of Texas Public School Teachers*. (ED 212 559) Huntsville, Texas: College of Education, Sam Houston State University, 1980.

McLaughlin, Milbrey Willin, et al., "Why Teachers Won't Teach." *Phi Delta Kappan*, February, 1986, 420-426.

Nelson, F. Howard., "New Perspectives on the Teacher Quality Debate: Empirical Evidence from National Longitudinal Survey." *Journal of Educational Research* 78: 133-140; January/February, 1985.

Schlechty, Phillip C., and Victor S. Vance, *Recruitment, Selection and Retention: The Shape of the Teaching Force*. (ED 221 541) Washington, D.C.: National Institute of Education, February 1982.

Vance, Victor S., and Phillip C. Schlechty, *The Structure of the Teaching Occupation and the Characteristics of Teachers: A Sociological Interpretation*. Chapel Hill, North Carolina: University of North Carolina, 1982.

Weaver, W. Timothy, "Solving the Problem of Teacher Quality, Part I." *Phi Delta Kappan*:108-115; October 1984.

Additional References

1. Doyle, Dennis P. and Terry W. Hartle, "Leadership in Education: Governors, Legislators, and Teachers." *Phi Delta Kappan*, September 1985, pp. 21-27.

2. Louis Harris and Associates, Inc., "The Metropolitan Life Survey of Former Teachers in America," April-June, 1985.

3. Ornstein, Allan C., "Teacher Salaries: Past, Present, Future." *Phi Delta Kappan* (61) June 1980, pp. 677-678.

Additional copies may be ordered from the NEA Professional Library, P.O. Box 509, West Haven, CT 06516.

Reproduction: No part of this report may be reproduced in any form without written permission from NEA Research, except by NEA-affiliated associations. Any reproduction of the report materials must include the usual credit line. Address communications to Editor, NEA Research.

National Education Association
1201 Sixteenth Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036